5-Year ASSESSMENT REPORT

for

WCC ETC

Health Program
Nurse Aide Training

for

Fiscal Year 2007 - 2010

November 15, 2010
Program Review Health Indicator Summary

ETC Programs
Nurse Aide Training
for Fiscal Year 2007 - 2010

Overall Program Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthy</th>
<th>Cautionary</th>
<th>Unhealthy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Program Demand

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthy</th>
<th>Cautionary</th>
<th>Unhealthy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Program Efficiency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthy</th>
<th>Cautionary</th>
<th>Unhealthy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Program Outcome

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Healthy</th>
<th>Cautionary</th>
<th>Unhealthy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

Program Review Health Indicator Summary ............................................................... i
Considerations for ETC Program Reviews ................................................................. iii
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................... i
Mission Statements ..................................................................................................... 1
  College mission statement ....................................................................................... 1
  Employment Training Center mission statement .................................................... 1
I. Executive Summary of Program Status ................................................................... 2
  A. Overall Program Status ..................................................................................... 2
  B. Overall Program Demand .................................................................................. 2
  C. Overall Program Efficiency ..............................................................................
  D. Overall Program Outcomes .............................................................................. 3
II. Program Description ............................................................................................... 3
  A. Description and history of the program .............................................................. 3
  B. Program goals/occupations for which this program prepares students ............. 5
  C. ETC Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) ......................................................... 5
  D. Admission requirements ................................................................................... 6
  E. Credentials, licensures offered ......................................................................... 6
  F. Faculty and staff ............................................................................................... 6
  G. Articulation agreements ................................................................................... 7
III. Quantitative Indicators for Program Review ........................................................... 7
  A. Current and projected positions in the occupation and annual new positions in HI .... 7
  B. Program training hours .................................................................................... 7
  C. Demand - Program Data .................................................................................. 7
  D. Demand - Perkins Core Indicators .................................................................. 8
  E. Efficiency – Program Data ................................................................................ 8
  F. Effectiveness - Program Data .......................................................................... 8
  G. Effectiveness – Perkins Measures .................................................................... 9
  H. Attainment of Student Learning Outcomes ....................................................... 9
IV. Graduate / Leavers ................................................................................................. 10
  A. Tracking data – successful transitions ............................................................. 10
  B. Surveys ............................................................................................................
V. Curriculum Revision and Review ............................................................................ 10
VI. Analysis of the Program ....................................................................................... 11
  A. Alignment with the mission statement ........................................................... 11
  B. Analysis of Demand Data ............................................................................... 11
  C. Analysis of Efficiency Data ............................................................................. 12
  D. Analysis of Effectiveness Data ....................................................................... 12
  E. Evidence of student learning ............................................................................ 12
  F. Resource sufficiency ....................................................................................... 12
  G. Recommendations for improving outcomes .................................................... 12
VII. Action Plan .......................................................................................................... 13
VIII. Budget Implications ............................................................................................ 13
Appendices .................................................................................................................. 14
Considerations for ETC Program Reviews

The Employment Training Center offers non-credit vocational training programs designed to ease the transition to the workforce and prepare individuals for academic and/or professional careers. These programs operate year-round and have frequent entry and exit dates (at least one per month). The durations of the programs range from 3 weeks to 17 weeks. The training programs are terminal by design.

In addition to our programs, ETC is able to create, modify, and design customized workshops and courses tailored to meet the needs of Hawaii’s employers and the dynamic changing labor market.

As such, ETC programs do not generate data in semesters, majors, SSHs, transfer rates, persistence or other indicators used in credit-based program review. ETC intakes may also bridge fiscal years, i.e., a training program with an intake in June (with a course completion in September) may bridge into the next fiscal year; consequently, enrollment data for these training programs will not be detailed in this report.

The indicators used in this program review report have been modified and re-labeled to reflect the nature of ETC training program.
Mission Statements

College mission statement

Windward Community College is committed to excellence in the liberal arts and career development; we support and challenge individuals to develop skills, fulfill their potential, enrich their lives, and become contributing culturally aware members of our community.

Employment Training Center mission statement

The mission of Windward Community College, Employment Training Center, is to serve the community by providing short-term, career-focused education and training in a flexible, learner-centered and supportive environment.

Health Program Mission Statement (pending approval)

Windward Community College, Employment Training Center’s Options in Health Careers Program is committed to increasing access to entry level health career training and excellence in instruction leading individuals to course completion and skill proficiency.
I. Executive Summary of Program Status
Review of the program rating

A. Overall Program Status

Overall, the status of the E.T.C. Options in Health Careers Program, nurse aide course is **healthy** in all areas: demand, effectiveness, program efficiency, program effectiveness and overall program outcomes.

The nurse aide program maintains an average 82% enrollment and an 88% completion rate. Greater than 75% of the students enrolled are of Native Hawaiian ancestry.

In addition to fulfilling The UH and community needs for health career courses and enrollment of Native Hawaiians, data shows that an average of 91% of completers took the State examination. Of those that attempted the exam, 92% passed the State of Hawaii, American Red Cross (ARC) certification examination. In addition, 52% of completers successfully transitioned to college courses and/or employment.

It is critical to note that the economic crisis of 2009-10 impacted students’ ability to afford the $300 ARC CNA exam, and their flexibility to transition to college courses.

B. Overall Program Demand

Overall program demand for the CNA course is healthy as evidenced by an average of 100 telephone inquiries per month; however, economic constraints hinder students’ ability to pay for training.

The State estimates that there will be a need for 821 new nurse aides and 703 new home health aides by 2014. The need for trained personnel is matched by a very high number of persons contacting the ETC Options in Health Careers Program requesting enrollment information. Enrollment in the nurse aide course has been as high as 92% capacity; unfortunately; students who might have been able to access entry-level training in the period 2009-10, have faced the need to hold more than one job with wage and schedule reductions in the employment sector.

Aggressive grant writing is responsible for maintaining enrollment at greater than 50% of capacity in 2010. When grant funds are available for tuition assistance, the program enjoys a three-month wait list for the course.

It is important to note that while credit courses are reporting record enrollments with increased financial aid counseling services, students accessing vocational training are not able to apply for federal financial aid. Instead, vocational students must rely on college-community partnerships to meet their needs for educational supports.

C. Overall Program Efficiency

Overall program efficiency is healthy. Enrollment stands at an average 82% of capacity. In the area of cost efficiency, the cost of employing a Registered Nurse faculty, as required by The State of Hawaii, to teach the nurse aide course is considerably higher than instructional costs for
other E.T.C. courses. The analysis section of this report further addresses the cost efficiency of the program.

D. Overall Program Effectiveness

Overall program effectiveness is healthy. The average completion rate decreased from an average of 94% between 2007 and 2009 to an average of 88% for the reporting period. The program is responsible for identifying students who would not perform safely in a long-term care setting. Students not demonstrating skills proficiently were exited from the program. As noted above, 92% of course completers who took the State of Hawaii, American Red Cross (ARC) certification exam passed and became Certified Nurse Aides.

E. Overall Program Outcomes

Overall program outcomes are healthy. According to the Perkins data the E.T.C. CNA program exceeded two of the three applicable goals in the following areas of student attainment: 1) vocational and technical skill proficiencies; and 2) post-secondary credential. These accomplishments are inline with the E.T.C. mission statement.

The transition of students from the course to jobs and other training is 52%. These accomplishments are responsive to the U.H. system strategic plan to increase enrollment and completion of underserved and underrepresented students.

The course has a completion rate of 88% and State certification pass rate of 92%. These accomplishments are in line with the CNA program mission statement.

II. Program Description

A. Description and history of the program

The description of the program: This State of Hawai‘i approved nurse aide program provides classroom and supervised clinical training in the basic fundamentals of safe and knowledgeable care giving. Nursing procedures such as taking vital signs; positioning; bathing; dressing and other personal care; and when/what to report to the nurse are covered in the classroom. Application of these procedures and skills are practiced in the clinical setting. Adult CPR training and job assistance services are included in the course. Integrated Academics sessions are included in the training, incorporating basic skills in medical vocabulary and math relevant to the nurse assistant field.

This program is focused on preparing students for the Hawai‘i State Nurse Aide Competency Evaluation Testing Program (testing fee not included in course) as well as providing job skills and developing attitudes and behaviors necessary for competent caregivers. After successful completion of the state examination, the graduate is a Certified Nurse Aide (CNA) as defined by state and federal laws under OBRA, long term care act of 1987. Certified Nurse Aides may obtain employment in hospitals, long-term care facilities (nursing homes), care homes, private homes, adult day care, and clinics.

The history of the program: The ETC nurse aide (NA) training program was developed in response to the State Department of Labor’s request to help fill the need for nurse aides in the
labor market as well as to fill a training need on Oahu. In October 1999 ETC began a Nurse Assistant Training Program (NATP). Test for Adult Basic Education (TABE) scores of students referred to ETC showed that these students would not meet the minimum requirements of Kapi’olani Community College’s nurse aide program. ETC developed an Integrated Academics component to complement the skills training and to increase successful completions.

In February 2005, Windward Community College’s, ETC’s nurse aide training program was the first on Oahu to be State approved.

The program was not offered during 2006-2007 academic year, due to inability to hire a qualified instructor.

In the summer of 2007, Dr. Jamie Boyd was hired as the Health Program Coordinator. In 2007, Dr. Boyd revised the 2005 NAPT course that was based on the American Red Cross curriculum; she restructured the curriculum to include fundamental concepts of nursing and Hawaiian health concepts.

The 2007-2010 has been a period of creative program planning to sustain student access to training in spite of severe economic constraints. With a capacity to enroll up to 50 students per year during the reporting periods, and average of 45 students (90%) were enrolled per program year and 40 (88%) completed the program. Graduate transition to jobs or college courses is down from an average of 78% in the first two-years of this report, to an average of 60% by the end of the reporting period.

One factor that contributed to decreases in transition is that some students who had minimal interest in ever working as a nurse aide enrolled in the course and later stated discomfort with the idea of caring for elder or medically fragile clients.

In 2007 the program received $150,000 in grant funds to support tuition waivers and pilot traditional Native Hawaiian healing practices in the curriculum. Student surveys revealed that Native Hawaiian values including: Ohana (family); Kuleana (responsibly to self and others); respect for Kupuna (elderly); and healing practices including: massage; healthy living; and connection to ‘Aina (land) enhanced their learning abilities in the classroom and clinical setting and their interactions with peers and family.

In 2009 the program made two significant gains in transitioning students from entry-level training and low-wage jobs ($12/hour) to advanced training and living-wage jobs ($35/hour): 1) we negotiated an MOA between WCC and KCC Nursing Program to reserve seats in the KCC nursing program for disadvantaged NATP completers to transition to higher academic training; and, 2) we secured over $500,000 in funds to help students cover education costs associated with advanced training.

Over the entire term of the nurse aide program’s existence, the program coordinator has been engaged in grant writing to secure $825,000 in funds from multiple funders (Office of Hawaiian Affairs, Kamehameha Schools, Queen’s Medical Center, and Perkins). Funds were used to subsidize tuition, maintain access to training for underserved students, and support underserved student to access advanced training.
B. Program goals/occupations for which this program prepares students

Program goals for students:

1) Students will be prepared to successfully complete a State of Hawai‘i Nurse Aide Competency Evaluation Testing Program.

2) Students will be prepared to meet workforce development demands to fill entry level nurse aide jobs.

3) Students will gain skills, attitudes and behaviors necessary for competent caregivers.

Program goals for program growth:

1) Maintain economic supports to sustain enroll. Growth at this time is difficult. Efforts are focused on sustaining current enrollment and completion successes.

C. ETC Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs)

Students who successfully complete ETC programs will:

1) Demonstrate career and employment readiness
   Goal: 75% of students will successfully complete the course and pass the State of Hawaii, Nurse Aide exam for certification.

   Attained: 91% of students successfully earned program certificates by completing at least 80% of the course competencies. 91% of students passing the course sat for the State Nurse Aide, of those, 92% passed the exam.

2) Broaden and enhance workforce capabilities
   Goal: 75% of students will be able to demonstrate proficiency in a minimum of 80% State required competency for CNA employment.

   Met: 88% of students demonstrated proficiency in a minimum of 80% of the State required competency (skills) for CNA employment.

3) Pursue further education and training opportunities
   Goal: 55% of students will successfully transition.

   Not met: 52% of students transitioned to jobs or enrolled in further training or college credit courses.

4) Continue pursuits that enrich their lives
CNA Program Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs)

The competencies listed in the catalog have been approved by the State Department of Health. The competencies are in areas such as: personal care skills, basic skills, nutrition, elimination, safety measures and communication.

See attached Certified Nurse Aide Competencies.

D. Admission requirements
   1) Application form
   2) Physical exam
   3) Two step TB test: which is the TB Clearance at the health care provider level
   4) Proof of immunization or immunity to Mumps, Measles and Rubella.
   5) TABE and COMPASS Test
   6) Minimum 9th grade reading level based on College test scores
   7) Clinical agencies require a Criminal Abstract stating no criminal record found

E. Credentials, licensures offered
   Nurse assistants in the State of Hawaii are required to be certified. Certification is granted by passing the Hawaii State Nurse Assistant Competency Evaluation Testing Program.

   Effective January 2005, Nurse Aide graduates from State-approved programs are skills certified as required by Medicare. Each faculty teaching the C.N.A program must also be approved but the State Department of Health Medicare/Medicaid office.

F. Faculty and staff

   Summary: One FT instructor, one casual-hire 0.75 FT instructor, and one FT APT position

   Dr. Jamie Boyd R.N. was hired in April, 2007 and approved by The State of Hawaii, Department of Health to instruct nurse aide courses, August, 2007. This faculty has been the lead instructor for the program during this report period. Casual hire instructors have been hired when grant funds supported Dr. Boyd’s reassignment to ‘out-of-class’ projects including research and professional development.

   Dr. Boyd was the principal investigator of a research grant to investigate the supports and barriers of students enrolled in entry level health care training to access jobs that provide a living-wage. That study was completed and findings were presented at two conferences and accepted for publication in the journal “Progress in Community Health Partnerships”, 2010.

   There is one full-time casual hire (A.P.T) assistant for the program.
G. Articulation agreements

E.T.C. Director Bernadette Howard and Dr. Jamie Boyd at Windward Community College, and the Community College Chancellors have secured a Memorandum of Agreement to transition qualified ETC CNA students to the Kapiolani Community College Associate Degree in Nursing (R.N. program).

H. Community connections

The program has numerous community connections. One significant connection is the contract with our clinical facility “Ann Pearl”, a 110 bed long term care facility located in Kane’ohe, Hawaii. Students participate in service learning with community partners including Ke Ola Mamo; Native Hawaiian health care system for ´Oahu, and Kokua Kalihi Valley.

Dr. Boyd, the program coordinator has connections to other community boards and organizations including: Papa Ola Lokahi: Native Hawaiian Cancer Research Center, as IRB member; Queen Liliuokalani Childrens’ Center, as Hui Hanai board Vice President.

III. Quantitative Indicators for Program Review

A. Current and projected positions in the occupation and annual new positions in the State

EMSI Spring 2008 Labor Demand data indicates that the demand for Nurse Aides has increased, and will continue to increase over the next 5 years. The Academic Planning, Assessment, and Policy Analysis (APAPA) in the Office of the Associate Vice President, Community Colleges Academic Affairs provides this data annually.

B. Program training hours

The program includes 100 hours of classroom lecture and 50 hours of clinical skill training in a long term care facility. Course curriculum was approved by The State of Hawaii Department of Health.

35 Demand – Program Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting Period 2007 - 2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Number of applicants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Enrollment – head count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Student contact hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Number of classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E Number of work-based learning placements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
D. Demand – Perkins Core Indicators

According to the 2008 – 2014 Industry Employment Projection for the State of Hawaii EMSI data, our industry will have the following growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Occupation title</td>
<td>5,644</td>
<td>6,465</td>
<td>821</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMSI pos. #</td>
<td>31-1012</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing Aides</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The industry trend demonstrates an urgent need to increase the capacity of C.N.A programs throughout the State to meet the growing need for nurse aides and home health aides.

E. Efficiency – Program Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2007-2010 EFFICIENCY</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Maximum enrollment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Average class size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Class fill rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>FTE G-funded faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>FTE all faculty &amp; instructional support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>Budget allocation – General funds only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>Budget allocation – Special funds only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K+L</td>
<td>Total Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(K+L)/C</td>
<td>Cost per student contact hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C:J</td>
<td>Student contact hour to instruction FTE ratio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F. Effectiveness – Program Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2007-2010 EFFECTIVENESS</th>
<th>Head count</th>
<th>Registrations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O</td>
<td>No. of enrolled students (B) scheduled to complete before reporting deadline</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>No. of scheduled completers actually retained in the program</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P/O</td>
<td>Percent retained</td>
<td>90.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>Number of scheduled completers receiving certificates</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O/R</td>
<td>Percent of scheduled completers receiving certificates</td>
<td>90.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>Number of scheduled completers who successfully transitioned</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1O/T</td>
<td>Percent of scheduled completers who successfully transitioned</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**G. Effectiveness – Perkins Measures**

**Program Outcomes - Perkins**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perkins Measures</th>
<th>Performance (%)</th>
<th>Baseline (%)</th>
<th>+/-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student attainment academic skill proficiencies (1P1)</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>80.81</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student attainment of vocational &amp; technical skill proficiencies (1P2)</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>91.53</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student attainment of a post-secondary credential (2P1)</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>34.95</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placement into employment (3P1)</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>69.77</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retention in employment. (3P2)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>90.13</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Traditional participation (4P1)</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-traditional completion (4P1)</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td></td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**H. Attainment of Student Learning Outcomes**

ETC’s Student Learning Outcomes
The program exceeded enrollment, completion and transition goals.

1. Demonstrate career and employment readiness
   Goal: 75% of students will successfully complete the course.
   Met: 88% of students who were scheduled to complete their training before report submission successfully earned program certificates by completing at least 80% of the course competencies.
2. Broaden and enhance workforce capabilities
   Goal: 75% of students will be able to demonstrate proficiency in a minimum of 80%
   State required competency for CNA employment.

   Met: 88% of students demonstrated proficiency in a minimum of 80% of the State
   required competency (skills) for CNA employment.

3. Pursue further education and training opportunities
   Goal: 55% of students will successfully transition.

   Not met: 52% of students transitioned to jobs or enrolled in further training or
   college credit courses.

Attainment of Program Student Learning Outcomes

Program completers met the CNA Program Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) when they
successfully met the course competencies. The competencies listed in the catalog have been
approved by the State Department of Health. The competencies are in areas such as: personal

care skills, basic skills, nutrition, elimination, safety measures and communication.

A Program goal is to maintain a state of continual data collection and evaluation regarding the
enrollment, retention, and completion students. It is projected that data will identify a need to
secure funds to help the student population interested in CNA training cover the tuition.

IV. Graduate / Leavers

A. Tracking data – successful transitions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of students</th>
<th>135</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work-based learning / Internships</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional training</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

V. Curriculum Revision and Review

In 2007, Dr. Jamie Boyd reviewed several nurse aide textbooks and found the “Textbook for
most appropriate for the W.C.C., C.N.A program. The curriculum has been updated to reflect
the changes in the 7th edition of the same Mosby text as well as upgrades to lecture and skills
training as needed.
The curriculum was revised several times in this reporting period: 2008, to include Native Hawaiian healing practices; 2009, to improve skills training; and in 2010, to include CNA course completers in ‘in-class’ skills training assistants.

VI. Analysis of the Program

A. Alignment with the mission statement

The C.N.A. program is closely aligned with the mission statements of E.T.C., W.C.C. and the University of Hawaii system.

Additionally, recognizing community workforce development demands and the multiple barriers associated with enrollment and completion of students traditionally enrolled in ETC programs. The Health Program expands upon the ETC’s mission and stands committed to increasing access to entry level health career training and excellence in instruction leading to course completion, proficiency in skill demonstration and passing competency examination.

B. Analysis of Demand Data

Strengths:

External measurement of demand: According to Spring 2008 EMSI, State of Hawaii Employment Data (position type code number SOC 31-1012) there will be a 15% increase in the need for Nursing aids, orderlies, and attendants between 2008 and 2014. The State estimates that there will be a need for 821 new nurse aides and 703 new home health aides by 2014.

The State’s estimation is confirmed by the high numbers of job advertisements for nurse aides and other health care personnel in local newspapers.

Internal measurement of demand: The need for trained personnel is matched by a very high number of persons contacting the ETC Options in Health Careers Program requesting enrollment information. A website has been constructed to meet the growing need for information about CNA training. Enrollment in the nurse aide course is at 88% capacity in spite of economic hardship across the State and nation. There is also a three month wait list for the course.

Weaknesses:

1) Students want to enroll, sign-up, then have problems with covering tuition.
2) Students experience barriers with non-training costs (rent, transportation, child care, health care, etc.).
3) Program is currently heavily subsidized by grants.
4) There is a continual need to seek new funds for staff salaries, student tuition and supplies.
C. Analysis of Efficiency Data

Strengths:

1) Enrollment stands at 82% of capacity.

2) Cost efficiency

Beyond cost equations are the benefits of service to the community in fulfilling the high demand for nurse aides.

Weaknesses:

The cost of employing a Registered Nurse faculty, as required by The State of Hawaii, to teach the nurse aide course is considerably higher than instructional costs for other E.T.C. courses. Covering the CNA faculty salary with tuition fees alone is limited by multiple factors; 1) Increasing the cost of tuition will be another barrier for students already having problems with accessing entry-level training; an, 2) increasing the cost would put ETC’s nurse aide course out of competition with other nurse aide courses.

D. Analysis of Effectiveness Data

Strengths:

The CNA program is fortunate to have weathered the economic storm thus far with funding from community partners. We experienced a decrease in all measures but were able to report above average results.

Weaknesses:

The average data across the reporting period is marred by the impact of the economic crises that resulted in drastic reduction in tuition supports and students needing to work to meet household needs instead of attending college.

E. Evidence of student learning

The pass rate on the Hawaii State Board Nurse Assistant Competency Evaluation (Testing Program) for certification is the most important benchmark of a successful C.N.A. program. The pass rate for ARC exam is 92%.

F. Resource sufficiency

The program relies very heavily on grant funds to support the cost of tuition for the students and office support staff.

G. Recommendations for improving outcomes

A program goal is to maintain current funding and access to training. In light of significant institutional changes at UH and WCC, the CNA program staff are focused on being flexible to the need for change and being diligent in securing resources to help students.
The following recommendations are made to improve enrollment, completion, and transition outcomes:

a. **Improve intake process.** Get feedback from potential students about barriers to enrollment using a survey at the point of intake.
b. **Explore potential enrollment barriers related to scheduling** (e.g. day versus evening or weekend courses) by piloting an online format using Laulima.
c. **Improve intake counseling** so that students understand that those who do not demonstrate skill proficiency and dedication to work in long term care will not successfully complete the program.
d. **Continue to integrate student feedback into curriculum design** – esp with Laulima.
e. **Work more closely with the program counselor** to implement support interventions for student retention and completion.
f. **As students have problems keeping cell phone and internet service active, address issues of barriers to contacting students after completion.**
g. **Continue tracking completers.**
h. **Continue to collaborate with transfer counselors and other supports.**
i. **Continue to collaborate with employers.**
j. **Continue to collaborate with Career Connections.**
k. **Seek a general-funded APT position** to support the office operations of the expanding health program.

**VII. Action Plan**

The plan is to adhere to UH Strategic Plan to provide access to education and training especially for students who have historically been underserved and underrepresented. We will continue to focus on students at risk for failure to access and complete workforce training.

1. Increase enrollments rates from 82% to 85%
2. Increase completion rates from 88% to 90%
3. Increase transition rates from 52% to 60%

**VIII. Budget Implications**

| One general-funded APT | $35,000 |
Appendices

Abbreviations and acronyms ..................................................................................................................

Sources of information .............................................................................................................................

Signature page ..........................................................................................................................................

Glossary of terms for Perkins core indicators for ETC programs ......................................................

Definitions and suggestions ......................................................................................................................
Abbreviations and Acronyms Used in this Program Review

(note: to be modified to fit ETC reviews as appropriate)

APAPA  Academic Planning, Assessment, and Policy Analysis
        Office of the Associate Vice President, Community Colleges Academic Affairs,
        University of Hawaii

CTE    Career and Technical Education

ETC    Employment Training Center

EMSI   Economic Modeling Specialist Incorporated

FTE    Full-time Equivalent

FY     Fiscal Year

HCC    Honolulu Community College

HOSP   Hospitality

IEC    Institutional Effectiveness Committee

IRO    Institutional Resource Office, University of Hawaii, Manoa

MAPS   Management and Planning Support, Institutional Research Office, University of
        Hawaii

PHI    Program Health Indicator

SIS    Student Information System, Employment Training Center

SLOs   Student Learning Outcomes

SSH    Student Semester Hours

UH     University of Hawaii

UHM    University of Hawaii at Manoa

WCC    Windward Community College
Sources of Information for this Program Review

The information sources for this report are:

2. Perkins 2004-2005 College Core Indicators provided by APAPA.
3. Academic Profile Database provided by APAPA.
4. Spring 2007 EMSI PHI Labor Demographics provided by APAPA.
6. MAPS Reports.
7. ETC program information.
8. Anecdotal information gathered by program faculty.
Signature Page

Faculty review and coordination for this report was provided by:

____________________________________ ETC Faculty

____________________________________ ETC Faculty

____________________________________ ETC Program Coordinator

Administration review for this report was provided by:

____________________________________ ETC Director

Bernadette Howard

____________________________________ Chancellor

Angela Meixell

Program information and research for this report was prepared by:

____________________________________ Coordinator, ETC Workforce

Development

Michael Moser

____________________________________ Director, Office of Institutional Research
Appendices

A. Glossary of terms for Perkins core indicators for ETC programs.

Time Period: July 1 2007 through June 30 2010.

Participant: a student registered for a vocational program (not TLC).

Concentrator: a student who has completed at least 25% of program hours

Completer: a concentrator who has been awarded a certificate in a vocational program, not TLC

1P1 Academic Skill Attainment: concentrators who have a competency rating of 3, 4 or 5 in integrated academic courses and who have stopped program participation before September 30th.

1P2 Vocational Skill Attainment: concentrators who have a competency rating of 3, 4 or 5 in vocational work (not integrated academics) and who have stopped program participation before September 30th.

1P1 Degrees and Credentials: concentrators who received a certificate and who stopped program participation before September 30th.

Placement 3P1: completers in the year reported who are employed within one UI quarter following program completion.

3P2 Retention: completers in the year reported who are employed within one UI quarter following program completion (Numerator for 3P1) and employed in the following UI quarter.

4P1 Non-Traditional Programs: participants in under-represented gender groups who participated in non-traditional programs in the year reported.

4P2 Non-traditional completion: completers in under represented gender group in non-traditional programs in the year reported.
DEFINITIONS & SUGGESTIONS

When writing your annual assessment it is always a good idea to write as though your audience does not know anything about ETC or your program. Reviewers could be accreditation team members, administration, or your colleagues. The following comments are only suggestions intended to give some guidance for the writing process.

**Sections I & II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Considerations for ETC Program Reviewers</td>
<td>No need to change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mission Statements | *No need to change  
*Adding your own program mission statement is optional. |
| Executive summary of program status | |
| Program Description | *General description of your program course(s), length, skill categories and training, instructional methodology, location, learning environment, typical student descriptors, intended audience, teaching philosophy, curriculum overview, standards based design, etc. (just ideas that may be discussed) |
| Program Goals | * Learning goals you may have for the students  
* Goals for the program’s growth, academics, curriculum, etc.  
* Goals would probably need to be addressed, revised, or modified in future reports  
* List of job titles your graduates might be eligible for |
| ETC student learning outcomes | * SLOs are a vital part of any annual assessment and would be reviewed by any accrediting organization.  
* Taken from the ETC catalog. Each program should be in line with the general ETC SLOs.  
* SLOs are always measured with reported outcomes and determination of meeting or not meeting the SLOs.  
* **We are suggesting that each program determine their own percentage and write those values into the spaces provided.** |
| Program student learning outcomes | * Optional for each program. Some programs have these and some do not.  
* Remember will always need to have outcomes reported. |
| Admissions requirements | * Refer to your catalog page for the 07-08 year. TABE test?, grade level equivalents, other requirements? |
| Credentials | * ie. Certificates? Requirements to receive the certificate |
| Faculty and staff | * Names, titles, and FTE for each staff including. Identify staff as G funded or Special funded. |
| Articulation agreements | * Any agreements or credits agreements with other campuses, systems, or DOE? |
| Community connections | * Advisory board?, service learning partnerships, volunteer work, service projects or any other partnerships your program may have with |
the community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IIA</td>
<td>Current and projected positions in the occupation and annual new positions in the state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIB</td>
<td>Program training hours</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section III - Quantitative Definitions / Notes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IIIC-Demand</th>
<th>Data Provided To You (Y / N)</th>
<th>Definitions</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A) Number or applicants</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(duplicated and unduplicated) &lt;br&gt; <strong>Purpose:</strong> To determine community interest in programs &lt;br&gt; <strong>Sum of:</strong> &lt;br&gt; Wait list students as noted by counselor &lt;br&gt; Pre registrations as noted by counselors &lt;br&gt; No shows &lt;br&gt; No. Withdrawals before 1 week &lt;br&gt; Withdrawals – after 1 week &lt;br&gt; Drops &lt;br&gt; Completers</td>
<td>This will be provided for you &lt;br&gt; Applications scheduled to start between 7/1 and 6/30. Include completion dates beyond the fiscal year &lt;br&gt; Registration database &lt;br&gt; Counselors would need to provide student name and program interest for “pre-reg”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B) Enrollment –</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(duplicated and unduplicated) &lt;br&gt; <strong>Sum of:</strong> &lt;br&gt; Withdrawals – after 1 week &lt;br&gt; Drops after 1 week &lt;br&gt; Completers &lt;br&gt; Excludes CCE workshops</td>
<td>This will be provided for you &lt;br&gt; Applicants started between 7/1 and 6/30. Include completion dates beyond the fiscal year &lt;br&gt; Registration forms &lt;br&gt; Registration database &lt;br&gt; * Recommend adding a column for your CCE workshops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C) Total student contact hours</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(based on duplicated student count) &lt;br&gt; Contact hours reported for: &lt;br&gt; Contact hours for students in block A &lt;br&gt; Withdrawals before 1 week</td>
<td>This will be provided for you &lt;br&gt; term reports submitted by faculty &lt;br&gt; Registration database &lt;br&gt; Include students who completed their training after 7/1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Withdrawals after 1 week
Drops
Completers

*D excludes CCE

* Recommend adding a column for CCE workshops

D) Number of classes

Y

* Excludes CCE

This will be provided for you

* Recommend adding a column for CCE workshops

E) Number of work-based learning placements

N

You provide this

No. of individual students enrolled in: Work Experience, Internships, Service learning, field experience from your program.

You provide this information and enter in table provided

Include students from the Career & Workforce Development Work Experience Program.

### III D Demand – Perkins Core Indicators

Refer to EMSI spreadsheet provided to you.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Occupation title</td>
<td>#</td>
<td>#</td>
<td>#</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Divide your value by 6!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III E Efficiency – Program Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Efficiency</th>
<th>Data Provided To You (Y/N)</th>
<th>Average no. of maximum possible registrations per class section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F) Maximum enrollment possible</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>This will be provided for you</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>G) Average class size</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>B / D</th>
<th>This will be provided for you</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Registration database</td>
<td>registration forms</td>
<td>early term reports</td>
<td>term reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| H) Fill rate | Y | (G / H) *100 | This will be provided for you |

<p>| I) FTE Faculty – | FTE of BOR appointed | You provide this information |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Funds only</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>teaching faculty only</th>
<th>Refer to section II F – Include the G-funded faculty FTE only</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>J) FTE all faculty &amp; instructional support</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>You provide data</td>
<td>You provide this information Refer to section II F – Include Instructors, EAs, APTs that provide direct student teaching assistance. Estimate their FTE contribution to their duties are split. Estimate IA instructor FTE contribution to your program. I.e. If a faculty or staff is ½ time teaching then FTE = 0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K) Program budget allocation – General funds only</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Total budget = personnel, equipment, supplies, travel, etc.</td>
<td>This will be provided for you General funded only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L) Program budget allocation – Soft funds</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Total budget = personnel, equipment, supplies, travel, etc.</td>
<td>This will be provided for you Soft funds only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M) Cost per student contact hour</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(K+L) / C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N) Student contact hour : Instruction FTE ratio</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>C : J</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III F Effectiveness – Program Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effectiveness</th>
<th>Data Provided To You (Y / N)</th>
<th>Data Provided To You (Y / N)</th>
<th>Data Provided To You (Y / N)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O) No. enrolled students (B) scheduled to complete before reporting deadline</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>No. enrolled after 7/1 of reporting year and scheduled to complete before report is submitted.</td>
<td>Includes students in section B scheduled to complete their training before report in submitted. Does not include students still in classes at time of submitting report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P) No. of scheduled completers actually retained in the program</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(duplicated and unduplicated) No. students completing hour requirements but not earning certificates, early completers with certificates. On-time completers with certificates. Do not include withdrawals or drops.</td>
<td>Includes: * attempting 80% of competencies * passing 80% of competencies Include students completing after 7/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q) Percent retained</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(duplicated and unduplicated) (P / O) * 100</td>
<td>Term reports registration dbase early terms registration forms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R) Number of scheduled completers receiving certificates</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(duplicated and unduplicated) No. enrolled after 7/1 of reporting year who received a certificate before this report is submitted.</td>
<td>Include students completing after 7/1 Term reports Records of training w/ 80% “meets” Include students completing after 7/1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S) Percent of scheduled completers receiving certificates</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(0/R) * 100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T) Number of scheduled completers who successfully transitioned</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(duplicated and unduplicated) No. enrolled after 7/1 of reporting year and successfully transitioned before report is submitted. “successful transition” = employment, internship, work experience, other ETC course, other non ETC course, secondary education, post secondary education, military, other trade training.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U) Percent of scheduled completers who successfully transitioned</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>(0/T) * 100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| III G  | Perkins Outcome measures  
*Most of this data will be provided to you from the systems office or ETC program staff*
Student attainment of academic skills
Student attainment of vocational skills
Placement into employment
Retention in employment
Non trad. Participation
Non trad. Completion |
| III H  | Attainment of ETC Student Learning Outcomes  
See previous data tables to determine actual performance for each ETC SLO |
| Attainment of program SLOs | Optional – you provide data or evidence. |
### Section IV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV A</td>
<td>Graduate Leavers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Work with CWD staff on these results. CWD will have data for those students who have been served by CWD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* CWD will provide a list of students with known tracking and employment history.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School / Training = Secondary, post-secondary, vocational training (ETC or non ETC),</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section V

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Curriculum revision and review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Any changes or modifications to your program or curriculum?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section VI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI A</td>
<td>Alignment with mission statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* How your program supports the mission of ETC. Any recommendations?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI B</td>
<td>Analysis of demand data in section IIIC &amp; D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Your observation and analysis on the data. What do the numbers mean? Factors affecting the numbers, outlook, and any recommendations you may have.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI C</td>
<td>Analysis of Efficiency data in section III E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI D</td>
<td>Analysis of the Effectiveness data in section III F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI E</td>
<td>Evidence of student learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* any quantifiable evidence? pre and post test scores?, certificates?, completers?, employment?, anecdotal comments?, any assessment test results,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI F</td>
<td>Resource sufficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Instructional material, supplies, space, staffing, equipment, curriculum, academic support, scheduling, or any other resources you are using or think you need.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI G</td>
<td>Recommendations for improving outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* What ideas do you have that may lead to improved retention, completion, attainment of competencies, job placement? policies, systems, procedures, forms, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Section VII**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Ideas: Change in curriculum, procedures, policies, forms, schedule, mode of instruction, partnerships, grant writing, new initiatives, outreach, recruitment, program reorganization or any other ideas you plan to implement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Actions plans should be driven by your analysis and findings of program data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Recommend linking your action plans to the WCC strategic plan whenever possible to strengthen a justification.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Section VIII**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>Budget Implications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* How does your action plan affect the budget? Any budget requests? Personnel, supplies, equipment, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>* Justifications could be strengthened if they are related to the WCC strategic plan and ETC mission.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>